Probing the QCD Phase Diagram with Fluctuations

Bengt Friman GSI Darmstadt

A Tribute to Gerald E. Brown Stony Brook Nov. 24-26, 2013



- Gerry played a crucial role for the education of young nuclear theorists in Finland
- A large number moved with Gerry's help from NORDITA to research positions in the US and later got faculty jobs in Finland

Exploring the QCD phase diagram



- Experiment
- Lattice QCD
- Models
- Focus on $\mu \simeq 0$
- O(4) transition(?)
- Chiral vs. deconf

Fluctuations \rightarrow phase boundary?

• Chiral susceptibility: $\chi_m = \frac{\partial^2 p}{\partial m_a^2}$



Freeze-out close to crossover

BNL-Bielefeld, PRD 85,054503

F. Karsch, 2013

Fluctuations of conserved charges

- Consider a subvolume V
- Susceptibility (2nd cumulant)

$$\chi = VT \frac{\partial^2 p}{\partial \mu^2} = \langle N^2 \rangle - \langle N \rangle^2 \qquad N = N_B - N_{\bar{B}}$$

- Less singular than order parameter fluctuations, but easier to access.
- Criticality shows up in higher cumulants:

$$\chi_n = c_n = VT \frac{\partial^n p}{\partial \mu^n}$$

Critical scaling

• Free energy density: backgound + singular part

 $f=f_r+f_s$ where $f_s(t,h)=h^{1+1/\delta}f_f(z)$

- Scaling variable $z = t/h^{1/\beta\delta}$ $t = (T - T_c)/T_c$ $h = m_q/T_c$
- Physical m_{π} in O(N) scaling regime

$$M = h^{1/\delta} f_G(z) + bg.$$



Ejiri et al., PRD 80, 094505

Baryon number cumulants ($\mu = 0$)

- Generalized scaling parameter $t = (T T_c)/T_c + \kappa (\mu/T_c)^2, \quad z = t/h^{1/\beta\delta}$
- Only even cumulants:

$$\chi_B^{2n} = -T \, \frac{\partial^{2n} F}{\partial \mu^{2n}} \sim -h^{(2-\alpha-n)/\beta\delta} f_f^{(n)}(z) + \dots$$

 $\chi_B^4 \sim -h^{-\alpha/\beta\delta} f_f^{(2)}(z) \to 0$ in chiral limit $(\alpha \simeq -0.2)$

$$\chi_B^6 \sim -h^{-(1+\alpha)/\beta\delta} f_f^{(3)}(z) / \sim \xi^{1.1}$$

$$\chi_B^8 \sim -h^{-(2+\alpha)/\beta\delta} f_f^{(4)}(z) / \sim \xi^{2.4}$$

Universal O(4) scaling function

Engels & Karsch
 PRD 85, 094506

$$\chi_B^4 \sim -h^{-\alpha/\beta\delta} f_f^{(2)}(z)$$

$$n \ge 6$$
 : $\chi_B^n < 0$ for $T \simeq T_{po}$







Baseline: HRG (no criticality)

• HRG reproduces lattice results, e.g. $\chi_4 (T < T_{pc})$ (Ejiri et al. 2006)

- and experiment $\chi_4/\chi_2 = 1$ $\chi_3/\chi_2 = \tanh(\mu/T)$ $\chi_2/\chi_1 = \coth(\mu/T)$ (Karsch, Redlich, 2011)
- Criticality in higher susc.





Tracking the phase boundary

- If $T_{fo} \simeq T_{pc}$, expect deviation from HRG $(\chi_6/\chi_2 \neq 1)^{\circ}$
- Allton et al. (Bielefeld-Swansea), PRD 71, 054508
- Look for $\chi_6/\chi_2 < 0$





Tracking the phase boundary

- If $T_{fo} \simeq T_{pc}$, expect deviation from HRG $(\chi_6/\chi_2 \neq 1)$
- PQM model (O(4) & Z(3)) in Functional RG
 B.F., Karsch, Redlich, Skokov, EPJ C71, 1694





STAR data (net proton fluctuations)

 Au-Au collisions show clear deviation from HRG expect.





Uncertainties: finite volume, non-critical fluctuations, acceptance corrections

Deconfinement transition

• Polyakov loop: order parameter of deconfinement in pure gauge theory

$$L = \frac{1}{N_c} tr_c \mathcal{P} \exp\left[i \int_0^\beta A_4 \, d\tau\right] \qquad \langle L \rangle = e^{-\beta F_q}$$

- Z(N) symmetry $L \rightarrow e^{2\pi i n/N_c}L$ broken for $T > T_c$
- In SU(3) Polyakov loop complex $L = L_R + i L_I$
- Often use $\langle |L|\rangle$ as order parameter
- Finite size effects



Deconfinement transition

 Polyakov loop: order parameter of deconfinement in pure gauge theory

$$L = \frac{1}{N_c} tr_c \mathcal{P} \exp\left[i \int_0^\beta A_4 \, d\tau\right] \qquad \langle L \rangle = e^{-\beta F_q}$$

- Z(N) symmetry $L \rightarrow e^{2\pi i n/N_c} L$ broken for $T > T_c$
- In SU(3) Polyakov loop complex $L = L_R + i L_I$

• Constraints from group struct. target space (SU(3)):



Polyakov loop fluctuations

• Polyakov loop susceptibilities in pure gauge th.

$$T^{3} \chi_{A} = \frac{N_{\sigma}^{3}}{N_{\tau}^{3}} \left(\langle |L|^{2} \rangle - \langle |L| \rangle^{2} \right)$$

- Lo, B.F., Kaczmarek, Redlich, Sasaki PRD 88, 014506, 074502 χ_A
- Narrow transition region!



 χ_R



10

 $T^3\chi_A$

$\begin{array}{c} 1 \\ 0.1 \\ 0.1 \\ 0.85 \\ 0.9 \\ 0.95 \\ 1 \\ 0.85 \\ 0.9 \\ 0.95 \\ 1 \\ 0.85 \\ 0.9 \\ 0.95 \\ 1 \\ 0.95 \\ 0.95 \\ 1 \\ 0.95 \\$

Renormalized

10



Ratios of susceptibilities

 Less sensitive to finite size and lattice effects;
 Signals gluon deconf.

• $T > T_c$ $\chi_A = \chi_R + \mathcal{O}(\chi_I^2)$

• $T < T_c$ consistent with Gaussian fluct.

$$\chi_A/\chi_R = 2 - \frac{\pi}{2}$$

 $Z = \int dL_R \, dL_I \, e^{V \, T^3 [\alpha(T)(L_R^2 + L_I^2)]}$ Good signature for deconf.!





Adding quarks

- Quarks break Z(3) symmetry explicitly
- Expect smooth transition between "pure glue" ratios.
- Lo, B.F., Kaczmarek, Redlich, Sasaki, PRD 88, 074502
 QCD results: HotQCD



- Quarks breaks Z(3) symmetry: very smooth cross over?
- What do fluctuations imply?
- χ_4/χ_2 sensitive to baryon # Ejiri et al., PLB 633, 275





- Quarks breaks Z(3) symmetry: very smooth cross over?
- What do fluctuations show?
- χ_4/χ_2 sensitive to baryon # Ejiri et al., PLB 633, 275
- χ_A/χ_R Polyakov loop susc.

HotQCD



- Quarks break Z(3) symmetry: very smooth cross over?
- What do fluctuations show?
- χ_4/χ_2 sensitive to baryon # Ejiri et al., PLB 633, 275
- χ_A/χ_R Polyakov loop susc. ⁰
- χ_I/χ_R " -

HotQCD



Lattice effects!

- Quarks break Z(3) symmetry: very smooth cross over?
- What do fluctuations show?
- χ_4/χ_2 sensitive to baryon # Ejiri et al., PLB 633, 275
- χ_A/χ_R Polyakov loop susc. ⁰
- χ_I/χ_R " -
- Action focussed at $T \simeq T_{\chi}$

Narrow transition!



HotQCD

Conclusions

- Higher cumulants of conserved charges probe \bullet chiral critical fluctuations
 - Basically robust, but several open issues remain: •
 - Sensitive to tail of distribution, cancellations
 - Overall conservation (Bzdak, Koch, Skokov)
 - Acceptance corrections (Bzdak, Koch)
 - Other sources of fluctuations (Skokov et al.) ightarrow



Conclusions II

- Fluctuations of Polyakov loop probe deconfinement
 - Indicate rather narrow transition, $T_{\rm dec}\simeq T_{\chi}$, not simply related to Polyakov loop
 - Consistent with analysis of strange d.o.f's across the QCD transition
 A. Bazavov et al. (HotQCD), PRL 111, 082301
 - also A. Dumitru et al., PRD 83, 034022
- Tune effective models (PNJL, PQM) to lattice results, including fluctuations

Darmstadt, June, 2006

